PaintCare, Inc.'s Request for Judicial Notice in Support of its Motion to Dismiss Complaint

Case No: 15-cv-04059-MEJ

VENABLE LLP 505 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 1400 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111 415-653-3750

REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE

I. INTRODUCTION

Exhibit

| Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 201, and in connection with its concurrently |
|--|
| filed Motion to Dismiss the Complaint pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6), defendant PaintCare, |
| Inc. ("PaintCare") requests that the Court take judicial notice of the following exhibits, |
| true and correct copies of which are attached hereto: |

| Exhibit A: | Excerpts of PaintCare's "California Architectural Paint Stewardship | | |
|------------|--|--|--|
| | Program Plan," dated June 4, 2012 (the entire PaintCare plan also is | | |
| | available at | | |
| | http://www.colrocycle.co.gov/Point/Plans/Pointcare/June/Lndf) | | |

| Exhibit B: | : Approval by the California Department of Resources, Recycling a | |
|------------|---|--|
| | Recovery ("CalRecycle") of PaintCare's California Architectural | |
| | Pain Stewardship Program Plan, signed on July 19, 2012 (also | |
| | available at | |
| | letter //www.collegovalago.com/Actions/Documents0/5C1120/5C2012 | |

http://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Actions/Documents%5C112%5C2012 %5C674%5CApproval%20of%20California%20Architectural%20P aint%20Stewardship%20Program%20Plan.pdf);

| Exhibit C: | Excerpts of PaintCare's California Paint Stewardship Program Yea | |
|---|--|--|
| | 1 Annual Report (2013), dated January 5, 2014 (the entire Annual | |
| | Report also is available at | |
| http://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/actions/Documents%5C77%5 | | |
| | 13%5C966%5CPaintCare%202013%20CA%20Annual%20Report% | |
| | 20with%20Appendices.pdf); | |

| D: | Approval by CalRecycle of PaintCare's California Architectural |
|----|--|
| | Pain Stewardship Program Year 1 Annual Report, signed on April |
| | 15, 2014 (also available at |
| | http://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Actions/Documents%5c124%5c20142 |
| | 014%5c1079%5cSigned%20RFA.pdf); |

| | 2 Annual Report (2014), dated November 1, 2014 (the entire Annual |
|------------|---|
| | Report also is available at |
| | http://www1.calrecycle.ca.gov/Paint/AnnualReport/2014/PaintCare. |
| | pdf); and |
| Exhibit F: | Approval by CalRecycle of PaintCare's California Architectural |
| | Pain Stewardship Program Year 2 Annual Report, signed on January |
| | 27, 2015 (also available at |
| | http://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Actions/Documents%5c124%5c20152 |
| | 014% 5c1266% 5cRequest% 20for% 20 Approval 1% 20- |

Excerpts of PaintCare's California Paint Stewardship Program Year

II. **ARGUMENT**

Exhibit E:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This Court should take judicial notice of Exhibits A, B, C, D, E, and F in considering PaintCare's Motion to Dismiss. Rule 201(b) of the Federal Rules of Evidence authorizes courts to take judicial notice of facts that are "not subject to reasonable dispute" and "can be accurately and readily determined from sources whose accuracy cannot reasonably be questioned." Fed. R. Evid. 201(b). No party can reasonably dispute the authenticity of any of the attached exhibits.

%20Signed.pdf).

A matter that is properly the subject of judicial notice may be considered along with the complaint when deciding a motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim. See MGIC Indem. Corp. v. Weisman, 803 F.2d 500, 504 (9th Cir. 1986) ("On a motion to dismiss, we may take judicial notice of matters of public record outside the pleadings."). The submissions of PaintCare's Stewardship Plan, PaintCare's Annual Reports, and the State's approval of the Stewardship Plan and Annual reports are publically-available documents part of the public record. This Court may take judicial notice of the Stewardship Plan and Annual Reports submitted to the State and the State's subsequent approval of those submissions pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 201. See Wynn v. Chanos, 75 F. Supp. 3d 1228, 1235 (N.D. Cal. 2014) (noting that "courts may consider

| 1 | matters of public record," and therefore taking judicial notice of financial disclosure | | | |
|----|---|----------|--|--|
| 2 | forms submitted to the SEC). | | | |
| 3 | Further, plaintiff's complaint refers to and relies upon the content of PaintCare's | | | |
| 4 | annual reports. Compl. ¶¶ 10, 28. In evaluating a Rule 12 motion, courts should take | | | |
| 5 | judicial notice and consider "documents whose contents are alleged in a complaint." | | | |
| 6 | Knievel v. ESPN, 393 F.3d 1068, 1076 (9th Cir. 2005). | | | |
| 7 | III. CONCLUSION | | | |
| 8 | PaintCare respectfully requests the | nat the | Court take judicial notice of Exhibits A, | |
| 9 | C, D, E, and F and consider those exhibit | its in c | onnection with its concurrently-filed | |
| 10 | Motion to Dismiss Complaint. | | | |
| 11 | | | Respectfully submitted, | |
| 12 | Dated: September 28, 2015 | | VENABLE LLP | |
| 13 | | | | |
| 14 | | By: | /s/ Thomas E. Wallerstein | |
| 15 | | | Thomas E. Wallerstein Attorneys for PaintCare, Inc. | |
| 16 | | | | |
| 17 | | | | |
| 18 | | | | |
| 19 | | | | |
| 20 | | | | |
| 21 | | | | |
| 22 | | | | |
| 23 | | | | |
| 24 | | | | |
| 25 | | | | |
| 26 | | | | |
| 27 | | | | |
| 28 | | 2 | | |
| | | 3 | | |

В,